



Website: <https://ejournal.uinib.ac.id/jurnal/index.php/mashdar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.15548/mashdar.v4i2.5398>

P-ISSN: [2685-1547](#) | E-ISSN: [2685-1555](#)

Fred M. Donner's Views on Orientalist Thought about the Distinction between the Qur'an and Hadith

Rizal Fathurrohman^{1*}, Marhumah²

¹Sunan Kalijaga State Islamic University, Indonesia

Email: 122304011005@student.uin-suka.ac.id, 2marhumah@uin-suka.ac.id

*Corresponding Author

Submitted: 2022-08-11	Revised: 2022-09-29	Accepted: 2022-11-08	Published: 2022-12-30
-----------------------	---------------------	----------------------	-----------------------

Abstract: The purpose of this paper is to explore Fred M. Donner's views on the distinction between the Qur'an and Hadith among orientalists. This study describes Donner's views on orientalist thought, especially John Wansbrough who stated that the Qur'an and Hadith originate from the same time. This paper uses a qualitative study in the type of library research with a descriptive qualitative analysis method to analyze and elaborate on the views of Fred M. Donner. The results of this study show that, in contrast to the hadiths which enthusiastically discuss political topics, the Al-Qur'an rarely provides answers about the political leadership of its followers. Second, unlike the hadiths, which are full of anachronistic allusions and explanations of earlier prophets, the Qur'an does not include any reference to events that occurred after previous prophets. Third, the textual vocabulary and preferences of the Qur'an and hadith when discussing religious practices vary. The contrast set forth above, thus refutes claims made by non-Muslim academics that the hadith were created at the same time as the Qur'an or were written before it. Because the hadith was made after the date of birth of the Qur'an, in a certain setting.

Keywords: Distinction of al-Qur'an and Hadith; Fred M. Donner; John Wansbrough; Orientalist.

Abstrak: Tujuan dari tulisan ini adalah untuk mengeksplorasi pandangan Fred M. Donner tentang distingsi Al-Qur'an dan Hadis di kalangan orientalis. Kajian ini memaparkan pandangan Donner terhadap pemikiran orientalis, khususnya John Wansbrough yang menyatakan bahwa Al-Qur'an dan Hadis berasal dari waktu yang sama. Tulisan ini menggunakan studi kualitatif dalam jenis penelitian kepustakaan dengan metode analisis kualitatif deskriptif untuk menganalisis dan mengelaborasi pandangan Fred M. Donner. Hasil kajian ini pertama-tama menunjukkan bahwa, berbeda dengan hadiths yang bersemangat membahas topik-topik politik, Al-Qur'an jarang memberikan jawaban tentang kepemimpinan politik umatnya. Kedua, tidak seperti hadiths, yang penuh sindiran anakronistik dan penjelasan nabi-nabi sebelumnya, Al-Qur'an tidak memasukkan referensi apa pun tentang peristiwa yang terjadi setelah nabi-nabi sebelumnya. Ketiga, kosa kata teks dan preferensi Al-Qur'an dan hadith saat membahas praktik keagamaan bervariasi. Kontras yang dikemukakan di atas, dengan demikian membantah klaim yang dibuat oleh akademisi non-Muslim bahwa hadith diciptakan bersamaan dengan Al-Qur'an atau ditulis sebelumnya. Karena hadith dibuat setelah tanggal lahirnya Al-Qur'an, dalam setting tertentu.

Kata Kunci: Distingsi al-Qur'an dan Hadiths; Fred M. Donner; John Wansbrough; Orientalis

INTRODUCTION

According to the canons (rules) of contemporary historical research, knowing more about Islamic history is very difficult because the source is very problematic.¹ Documentary sources on the origins of Islam do not exist in essence, namely in the form of original physical evidence that is contemporaneous with the origins of Islam, such as inscriptions, currency, archaeological evidence, papyrus (water reed), and parchment (animal skins). As a result, the widely accepted explanations for the origins of Islam are based on chronicles and other written sources produced by Islamic tradition itself. However, while this is true on a large scale, there are only literary sources whose documentary significance is hotly debated.²

Attempts to take a revisionist stance by orientalists, such as Arthur Jeffery and John Wansbrough have been made since the 19th century when historical criticism first emerged.³ Arthur Jeffery dalam *Material for the History of the Text of the Qur'an*⁴ dan John Wansbrough dalam *Quranic Studies: Sources and Methods of Scriptural Interpretation*⁵, argues that using Islamic sources with a traditional approach as the only foundation for recreating early Islamic history is problematic. This orientalist group, which considers itself a revisionist school, has rigid canons in terms of history, so they will not use historical sources that are inconsistent with the object they study.⁶ Several orientalists follow their direction, but some oppose his thesis, Chase F Robinson and Fred M. Donner for example. In this case, the author focuses more on one orientalist who rejects this idea with his academic arguments, namely Fred M. Donner

Orientalists seem truly dedicated to studying and understanding the Qur'an in depth by using the latest methodologies starting from the 19th century AD. Thus, the 20th century was an initial and significant turning point in the development of various Islamic academic-scientific critical research by non-Muslim research. However, the works and ideas of non-Muslim academics who see the Qur'an as a holy book inspired by earlier texts still have an unfavorable view of Islam as a result of their study of the Qur'an. Hence, such writings and ideas—as well as those of Abraham Geiger, Julius Wellhausen, Richard Bell, and John Wansbrough—seem to be more polemical.⁷

Typologically, there are two extreme spectrums of orientalist thought regarding the history of the Qur'an and Hadith: traditionalist-descriptive and revisionist-skeptical. Traditionalist-descriptive is described as a school that explores and discusses Islamic texts following the basic principles and traditions of Muslim intellectuals. Meanwhile, the revisionist-skeptical school examines Islamic sources critically and compares them with modern evidence. Consequently, the traditionalist descriptives take for granted the originality and authenticity of the Qur'an and hadith, while the revisionist skeptics reject them. However, not all orientalist studies are negative, they seem to attack and try to rebuild the history of the Qur'an and Hadith on the one hand, and are neutral and even defend a current understanding of the history of the Qur'an and Hadith on the other.

As Wansbrough begins his analysis of the Qur'an and Hadith by speculating that various verses originate from different communities. Moreover, he assumed that some, if not all, of the Qur'anic suras, were not written in Arabic, but in Iraq or Syria. In his view, the Qur'anic writings were gradually harmonized and it was only completed in the late second or early eighth century. He argued that the texts that eventually received scriptural status were only a small part of a much larger body of proverbs, fables, and wisdom literature that were passed on to many communities. However, most of this material was never considered sacred text and was instead used to produce

¹ Fred McGraw Donner, *The Beginnings Of Islamic Historical Writing* (United States of America: The Darwin Press, 1999).

² Fred McGraw Donner, *Narratives Of Islamic Origins* (United States of America: The Darwin Press, 1998).

³ Jonathan C. Brockopp, "Interpreting Material Evidence: Religion at The Origins of Islam," *History of Religions* 55, no. 2 (2015): 121–47.

⁴ Arthur Jeffery, *Material for the History of the Text of the Qur'an* (Leiden: E.J Brill, 1937).

⁵ John Wansbrough, *Quranic Studies: Sources and Methods of Scriptural Interpretation* (Oxford: Oxford Univ Press, 1977).

⁶ Mun'im Sirry, *Kontroversi Islam Awal: Antara Mazhab Tradisionalis Dan Revisionis*. (Jakarta: Mizan, 2015).

⁷ Fred McGraw Donner, *The Historian, The Believer, and The Qur'an* (New York: Routledge, 2011).

hadith. Wansbrough uses the Qur'an, Hadith, and other narrative sources to recreate early Islamic history.⁸

Comments on the dependence of Islam on Judaism and Christianity. All religions exist in history, said Fazlur Rahman.⁹ This also applies to Judaism, Christianity, and Islam. Even though this also applies to Judaism, Christianity, and Islam. Although all three come from God, God has intervened in history for the good of mankind. To demonstrate this, Rahman claims that the history of the two religions in the Arab world must be traced. And to get a historical basis one has to follow the Arab tradition itself, not the Jewish or Christian tradition. Orientalists are actively researching whether Islamic ideas had an impact on earlier religions and whether Islam stands alone regardless of its origins in Judaism and Christianity.¹⁰

On another angle, Fazlur Rahman in his writing entitled *The Living Sunnah and al-Sunnah wa al-Jama'ah* argue that the hadith of the Prophet existed since the beginning of the development of Islam because everything that was said, done, and approved by the Prophet was transmitted during his lifetime. Both relate to matters concerning the wider public and mas.¹¹ Both relate to matters of wider public concern and strictly private matters. The Prophet became famous as a leader and messenger of Allah because almost all of his words and deeds included laws, except for some that only dealt with worldly matters.¹² There are three reasons Donner's thinking is important and useful to study, according to the justification above. Al-Qur'an and Hadith's other orientalist perspectives are criticized and refuted, among others, by Donner, one of the current non-Muslim scholars. Second, Donner seems to be debating authenticity and consistency amidst two spectrums in his criticisms and refutations. Third, Donner offers a contribution in the form of a planned study of the Qur'an and Hadith in the West in addition to criticism and refutation.

This study relates to research conducted by Mukhlisin Saad who examines Fred M. Donner's thoughts regarding early Islamic narratives and the authenticity of the Qur'an.¹³ Then the research was conducted by Rizki and Reynaldi on orientalist views on the origins of Islam and the creation of the Qur'an and Hadith.¹⁴ Subsequent research conducted by Yusuf Rahman examined the history of Al-Qur'an texts and interpretations in the early Islamic period using traditionalist and revisionist approaches.¹⁵ Another research was also conducted by Sulaiman Ibrahim, who analyzed John Wansbrough's thoughts on the history of the Qur'anic text.¹⁶ There is also research conducted by Tasmin Tanggareng, discussing the study of hadith among Islamologists.¹⁷ The gap between the research above and this research lies in the focus of research studies that try to explore Fred M. Donner's view of the distinction between the Qur'an and Hadith among orientalists.

In addition, no research directly analyzes Fred M. Donner's thoughts regarding the origins of Islamic sources and his views on orientalist thought regarding the distinction between the Qur'an and Hadith. As described in the previous studies above, the novelty of this research lies in the research focus raised. Thus, this paper aims to analyze Donner's views, criticisms, and responses to

⁸ Fred McGraw Donner, *The Beginnings Of Islamic Historical Writing* (United States of America: The Darwin Press, 1999).

⁹ Fazlur Rahman, *The Major Themes of the Qur'an, Terj, Anas Mahyudin Dengan Judul, Tema Pokok Al-Qur'an* (Bandung: Pustaka, 1985).

¹⁰ Fazlur Rahman, *Approach to Islam in Religious Studies* "Dalam Richard C. Martin, *Approaches to Religious Studies* (United States of America: The University of Arizona Press, 1985).

¹¹ Fazlur Rahman, "The Living Sunnah and Al-Sunnah Wa Al-Jama'ah," in *Hadith and Sunnah: Ideals and Realities* (Kuala Lumpur: Islamic Book Trust, 2006), 150.

¹² Muhammad 'Ajjaj Al-Khatib, *Al-Sunnah Qabl Al-Tadwin* ((Bairut: Dar All-Fikr, 1997).

¹³ Mukhlisin Saad, "Narasi Islam Awal Dan Problem Otentisitas Al-Qur'an: Telaah Terhadap Pemikiran Fred Donner" (Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Ampel Surabaya, 2017).

¹⁴ Rizki Ulfahadi and Reynaldi Adi Surya, "Pandangan Orientalis Terhadap Sejarah Islam Awal," *USHULUNA: JURNAL ILMU USHULUDDIN* 4, no. 2 (2018): 184–201.

¹⁵ Yusuf Rahman, "Pendekatan Tradisionalis Dan Revisionis Dalam Kajian Sejarah Pembentukan Al-Qur'an Dan Tafsir Pada Masa Islam Awal," *Journal of Qur'a>n and H}adi@th Studies* 4, no. 1 (2015): 129–45.

¹⁶ Sulaiman Ibrahim, "Sejarah Teks Al-Qur'an: Studi Atas Pemikiran John Wansbrough," *Jurnal Farabi* 13, no. 2 (2016): 187–207.

¹⁷ Tasmin Tanggareng, "Orisinalitas Hadis Nabi SAW Perspektif Islamolog," *TAHDIS* 11, no. 1 (2020): 37–40.

orientalist thought, especially John Wansbrough, regarding the distinction between the Qur'an and Hadith.

METHOD

This research is a literature study, which attempts to formulate Fred M. Donner's view of orientalist thought regarding the distinction between the Qur'an and hadith. For primary sources, the author consults and draws on analysis and synthesis of several works by Donner on the Qur'an and Hadith, including *Narratives of Islamic Origins* (1998), *The Historical Context* (2006), and *The Historian, The Believer, and The Qur'an* (2011). While secondary sources include articles that talk about Donner's view of the distinction between the Qur'an and Hadith. A qualitative-descriptive approach is used to analyze and elaborate on Fred M. Donner's views on orientalist thought about the distinction between the Qur'an and hadith.

In this analysis, there are at least two interrelated functions to understand the contents of sacred texts.¹⁸ First, is the historical function, which aims to convey textual meaning following its historical setting. Second, the implication function aims to elaborate on Donner's view of the orientalist regarding the distinction between the Qur'an and Hadith. By using Donner's lens, this study responds to an orientalist perspective concerning the differences between the Qur'an and Hadith.¹⁹

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Biography of Fred M. Donner and His Work

Fred M. Donner is a professor emeritus of near eastern history at the University of Chicago.²⁰ He was born in 1945 in Washington, DC He graduated from Princeton University's Oriental Studies program in 1968. He also completed his Arabic studies at the Center for Middle Eastern Arab Studies (MECAS) in Lebanon before graduating. In 1975, he received his Ph.D. from Princeton University. And, since 1982, he has taught in Chicago as a professor specializing in classical Islam. *Muhammad and the Believers: At the Origins of Islam*, *Narratives of Islamic Origins*, and *The Early Islamic Conquests* are his most famous works.²¹

Professor Peter B. Ritzma teaches Eastern history and is an expert in Islamic studies at the Center for Middle Eastern Studies (CMES), the Oriental Institute, and the Department of Near Eastern Languages and Civilizations (NELC), all at the University of Chicago.²² Fred McGraw Donner, also known as Fred M. Donner, is a scholar specializing in Islamic studies. Donner grew up in Basking Ridge, New Jersey, and was born on September 30, 1945, in Washington, D.C. Donner began his high school career at Bernard Township Public School in this latter location, where he finally completed his studies in July 1963.

Donner pursued higher studies at the Department of Oriental Studies at Princeton University after completing his secondary education, where he earned a BA (Bachelor of Arts) degree summa cum laude in 1968. At that time, Donner completed and defended his senior undergraduate thesis, entitled *Arab Control of Armenia and the Caucasus 638-888*. Donner studied two languages in addition to his studies at Princeton, taking Arabic in the summer of 1965 at the University of Michigan, German in the summer of 1967 at the University of Munich, and Columbia University's Center for Middle Eastern Arabic Studies in Shimlan, Lebanon.

Donner made two trips to Germany between 1968 and 1971. The first, was during Donner's time in the military from 1968 to 1970, when he served as a radio wiretap and German language operator at the small town U.S. Army Security Agency Field Station. German Herzogenaurach. Second, after

¹⁸ J. E. Gracia, *A Theory of Textuality: The Logic and Epistemology* (New York: State University of New York, 1995).

¹⁹ Abdul Mustaqim, "Model Penelitian Tokoh (Dalam Teori Dan Aplikasi)," *Jurnal Studi Ilmu-Ilmu Al-Quran Dan Hadis* 15, no. 2 (2014): 201-18.

²⁰ Emeritus Staff, "Online Directory," The University of Chicago, 2022, <https://directory.uchicago.edu/individuals/results?utf8=√&name=Fred+McGraw+Donner&organization=&cnetid=>

²¹ Paul M. Cobb, *The Lineaments of Islam: Studies in Honor of Fred McGraw Donner* (Leiden-Boston: Brill, 2012).

²² Emeritus Staff, "Online Directory," The University of Chicago, 2022, <https://directory.uchicago.edu/individuals/results?utf8=√&name=Fred+McGraw+Donner&organization=&cnetid=>

servicing in the military from 1970 to 1971, to pursue a degree in Eastern Philology (Orientalische Philologie/Oriental Philology) at the Friedrich-Alexander Universität near Erlangen. Donner had the opportunity to learn about the techniques German linguists used to interpret religious texts from this meeting.

Donner was amazed by the great advances in the study of medieval European history compared to the Near East during his time in Germany. Donner is left to ponder how much or more scholars (Islamic scholars) understand Islamic society than they do about medieval European civilization. Donner started his Ph.D. studies at Princeton University after his trip to Germany, motivated by his interest and curiosity about Islam. Donner began his academic career as an Assistant Professor at Yale University from 1975 to 1980 after graduating from Princeton University.²³ Donner was later appointed Associate Professor of History at the same university from 1980 to 1982. After seven years at Yale, Donner moved to the University of Chicago as Associate Professor of Near Eastern History and was promoted to Professor of Near Eastern History in 1997 attention to two areas of study since moving to Chicago in the fall of 1982: Islamic history and civilization and Islamic ideas.²⁴

Donner has administrative and professional responsibilities in addition to his role as researcher, educator, and dissertation adviser. For example, Donner was and is being respected for his professional work as a program evaluator, peer reviewer, tenure document or promotion outside evaluator, external dissertation examiner, and reviewer of articles and book manuscripts at universities in North America (United States and Canada), Europe (Austria, United Kingdom, and France), and the Middle East (Saudi Arabia, Israel, Lebanon, Egypt, and the United Arab Emirates).

Paul M. Cobb saw Donner as a dedicated character and a teacher who offered many advantages in various Islamic studies courses, at both undergraduate and graduate levels, based on this intellectual endeavor and work.²⁵ These initiatives complement Donner's off-campus initiatives to educate non-specialist audiences about the complexities of Islamic history in the public sphere both at home and abroad. This was demonstrated, among other things, through a series of NEH-funded seminars in which Donner informed and educated a group of high school teachers about the Middle East. The purpose of this series of lectures is to prepare instructors to act as connectors or bridges for students who are looking for information about the Middle East.

Al-Qur'an and Hadith on Political Leadership

Let's start with the relationship between the Qur'an and Hadith. If the Qur'anic text is the product of the same context that produced the hadiths and origin myths, then the hadiths and different passages in the early narrative sources include "sub-canonical" versions of the Qur'an, to borrow Wansbrough's version. say. The Qur'an crystallized at roughly the same time and under roughly the same historical circumstances, but for very different purposes: the Qur'an was for liturgical needs and reading, while the hadith served public interpretation and historical needs.²⁶

According to Donner, one of the most salient elements of hadith collections and accounts of the origins of Islam is the extent to which they reflect the significant political concerns of the first and second centuries. The hadiths are full of traditions about what makes community leadership good and bad, and when Muslims are expected to obey their leaders. This can be seen, for example, in several hadiths where the Prophet examines the issue of loyalty to established authorities. Imams (religious leaders), caliphs/amirs, and presidents/governors are examples. Obedience to the true priest is often emphasized.²⁷ Even though the imam acted wrongly, the Prophet still encouraged obedience and loyalty to him. As Bukhori hadith number 7053.²⁸

²³ Editor Yale, "Explore Our Campus," Yale University, 2023, <https://www.yale.edu/about-yale>.

²⁴ Atika Salsabila, "Dakwah Islam Nabi Muhammad: Analisis Komparatif Historiografi Karya Ibnu Hisham Dan Donner" (Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Ampel Surabaya, 2020).

²⁵ Cobb, *The Lineaments of Islam: Studies in Honor of Fred McGraw Donner*.

²⁶ John Wansbrough, *Qur'anic Studies: Sources and Methods of Scriptural Interpretation* (Oxford: Oxford Univ Press, 1977)

²⁷ D I Ansusa Putra, "Recognizing an Islamic Hero: The Quran-Hadith's Vision about Muhammad Al-Fatih In Indonesian Comics," *Ulumuna* 26, no. 1 (2022): 119–44, <https://doi.org/10.20414/ujs.v26i1.474>.

²⁸ Ibnu Hajar Al Asqalani, *Fath Al-Bari* (Beirut: Dar Kutub Al Islamiyah, n.d.).

مَنْ كَرِهَ مِنْ أَمِيرِهِ شَيْئًا فَلْيَصْبِرْ، فَإِنَّهُ مَنْ خَرَجَ مِنَ السُّلْطَانِ شَيْئًا مَاتَ وَبِتَّةً جَاهِلِيَّةً

Meaning: Whoever hates the actions (policies) that exist in his ruler, let him be patient. Because anyone who comes out of (obedience) to the authorities (as if) just an inch, then he will die as the death of the ignorant people.

All this content shows how seriously the hadith takes the issue of political leadership. Who should lead the way? What rules must be applied? What should society do if it has to choose between two (or more) evil competitors or leaders? What rights do leaders have in terms of administration, law, policy, and morals? Moreover, no student of hadith can conclude that the topics that frequently appear in hadith literature are echoes of the arguments that raged among believers in the first and second Hijri/seventh and eighth centuries AD. In comparison, the Qur'anic text contains very few references to political or religious leadership. Surah An-Nisa verse 59 is almost the only passage in the Qur'an that seems to allude to the continuity of governmental authority after Muhammad.

Substantial differences between the Qur'an and the hadith on the issue of political leadership clearly show that the two holy books do not originate from the same "sectarian environment", but in relatively separate historical circumstances. One might argue that political leadership and related issues support Wansbrough's theory. However, the assumption that the Qur'anic text predates political concerns rooted in the hadith is a much more logical method of explaining the Qur'anic text's silence on the issue of political leadership.²⁹ A much more plausible explanation for the Qur'an's silence on political leadership is the assumption that the Qur'anic text, as we understand it today, came before political themes became so clearly embedded in the hadith.³⁰

From Anachronisms to Previous Prophets

The examples of the previous chapter highlight the most obvious and fundamental difference between the Qur'an and hadith: The Qur'an does not include anachronistic allusions to people, groups, or events. On the other hand, the hadiths are full of inconsistencies.³¹ Evidence that the Qur'an, unlike the hadiths, does not include political and leadership references after the Prophet. Non-Islamic academics, such as Wansbrough, argue that the Qur'an was written after the hadith.³² However, such an argument assumes that the compilers assumed by Wansbrough had a critical-historical sensibility, which seems doubtful. Because, if such an idea is accepted, it is important to explain why people with such a biased view of history wrote out-of-date content (political concerns) in hadith collections, which they also wrote. As such, this shows that the Qur'an was not an early document and, like the hadiths produced by the "sectarian context" of the late first and second Hijri centuries, should be considered to be less than reliable.³³

The Qur'an, on the other hand, makes no mention of events, persons, groups, or situations that occurred after the times of Muhammad, 'Abbasid, Umayyad, Zubayrid, 'And Alid, arguments about wills and liberties, differences of opinion about tax revenues and conversion, tribal rivalry, conquest, and so on. This shows that the Qur'an, in its present form, was already a "closed" text at the time of the First Civil War. Although Wansbrough and his supporters argue that the Qur'an was written much later, the compilers were careful to remove any information that might indicate a later composition of the text as it is out of date. This argument, however, makes the unlikely assumption

²⁹ Danang Fachri Adz Dzikri, "Pemikiran William Montgomery Watt Tentang Sosok Muhammad Dalam Karyanya Muhammad Prophet And Tasteman," *Al-Dzikra: Jurnal Studi Ilmu Al-Qur'an Dan Al-Hadits* 16, no. 1 (2022).

³⁰ Fred McGraw Donner, *The Beginnings Of Islamic Historical Writing* (United States of America: The Darwin Press, 1999).

³¹ M. Dani Habib, "Pandangan Ignaz Goldziher Terhadap Asal-Usul Munculnya Hadis Nabi Muhammad SAW," *AKTUALITA Jurnal Penelitian Sosial Dan Keagamaan* 10, no. Desember (2020): 89–98.

³² John Wansbrough, *Qur'anic Studies: Sources and Methods of Scriptural Interpretation* (Oxford: Oxford Univ Press, 1977)

³³ C.R.C.M. Zain, "Integration of Islamic Management Principles and Values According to the Qur'an and Hadith in Fostering Halal Governance in Malaysia," *AlBayan* 20, no. 2 (2022): 157–81, <https://doi.org/10.1163/22321969-12340112>.

that these purported compilers—whose names are never explained in any way —had historical critics much like ours.³⁴

Even if we make this assumption for the sake of argument, we still need to explain why people with a narrow view of history allow outdated information to proliferate so freely among the sayings attributed to Muhammad in the collection of hadiths, which they also compiled. They do this to serve their various theological and political agendas. The notion that the Qur'an is not the original book but, like the hadith, the product of the late first and second Hijri "sectarian contexts" must be considered inadequate based on these factors alone.

Accordingly, when the Qur'an and hadith deal with the same issue, they may place a very different emphasis on it or deal with it in a very different way. Qur'anic and hadith literature, for example, regularly refers to various pre-Islamic prophets who were Muhammad's predecessors: Adam, Noah, Abraham, Job, Moses, Jacob, Yusuf, David, Isa, and so on. A distinctive pattern emerges when the descriptions of these individuals are compared between the Qur'an and the hadith. Usually, the hadith narrations know more about these prophets from the Qur'an. The focus is reversed with certain figures, such as Nabi Saleh and the Thamud. We know certain things about them from the Qur'an, but the hadith literature has little to offer.³⁵

Same "sectarian context", it is impossible to explain this difference. Conventional interpretations of the timeline and origins of the Qur'an, on the other hand, offer a much more logical justification. There appears to be literature about Prophet Saleh and the Thamud, including both Jews and Christians, circulating in the West Arab region where Muhammad lived. However, followers are lacking in Iraq and Syria, which are home to the "sectarian climate" that gave rise to much of the hadith literature. Therefore, Prophet Saleh and Thamud are more prominent in the Qur'an than in the Hadith. On the other hand, it is not surprising that the latter shows the influence of these competing traditions so clearly as the Jewish and Christian traditions were among the main rivals that helped create the early Islamic tradition as demonstrated in the hadiths and origin stories. However, the early community of believers no longer saw Thamud as a political or religious danger.³⁶

Salat, Syafaat, and the Lexicon of the Qur'an and Hadith

The Qur'an and Hadith both speak a great deal about the necessity of rituals and their provisions, but they do so in very different ways. The Qur'an often mentions prayer as a ritual practice, usually instructing believers to pray fervently, and so on. However, it doesn't go too deep into how the ritual prayers should be performed; On the other hand, there is an assumption that the Qur'an alludes to the procedures for praying which were well known among the early readers of this book, so there is no need to explain in detail about the procedures for praying. It does not, for example, determine how many daily prayers Christians should have.³⁷

Hadith, on the other hand, has hundreds of hadiths that exhaustively explain (and often contradict) every aspect of prayer practice. Given the importance of the obtained Qur'an as the basis for legal decisions in Islamic tradition, we are at a loss to explain the Qur'an's reluctance to more precisely describe ritual prayer when the Qur'an is the product of a different intellectual context. However, if we accept that the wording of the Qur'an represents the reality of early Muslim society in Arabia, the discrepancy between the Qur'an and the hadith is understandable.³⁸

Another aspect of the prayer worth considering in this context is the Friday prayer routine. There are several proper ceremonial requirements for the Friday prayer, in particular for the sermon, which

³⁴ Ahmad Labib Majdi, "Diskursus Islam Kesajanaan Non-Muslim (Telaah Pemikiran Fred McGraw Donner)" (Universitas Islam Negeri Syarif Hidayatullah, 2021).

³⁵ Fred McGraw Donner, *Muhammad Dan Umat Beriman Asal-Usul Islam* (Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 2015).

³⁶ Khairul Amal, "Historiografi Jihad: Ekspedisi Awal Kaum Militer Di Madinah" (Universitas Islam Negeri Syarif Hidayatullah, 2017).

³⁷ Fred McGraw Donner, *The Beginnings Of Islamic Historical Writing* (United States of America: The Darwin Press, 1999).

³⁸ S Hakak, "Digital Hadith Authentication: Recent Advances, Open Challenges, and Future Directions," *Transactions on Emerging Telecommunications Technologies* 33, no. 6 (2022), <https://doi.org/10.1002/ett.3977>.

is the essence of the Friday prayer and is fully discussed in the hadith literature. The Qur'an, on the other hand, says nothing about Friday prayers. Only one verse in the Qur'an mentions Friday prayers and does not provide a technical name for this type of ritual. The important ceremony of Friday prayer, the khutbah, is also not mentioned in the Qur'an. It is very important to examine the technicality of this liturgical purpose if, as Wansbrough claims, the Qur'an crystallized in the first two centuries of Islam strictly for liturgical reasons because there is a textual exclusion of every important reference, let alone description.³⁹ Therefore, Wansbrough's previous prediction still needs to be clarified.⁴⁰

Syafaat for the deceased is discussed differently in the Qur'an and hadith compared to other sources. Contrary to the Qur'an, which (as in the Jewish tradition) views intercession ambivalently: sometimes intercession is outright refused, while at other times it is allowed for Muhammad (as in the Jewish tradition, for Abraham), but only for him and only under very specific circumstances did the hadith literature allow Muhammad to intercede (when the intermediary had been approved by God).⁴¹

In the past, CH Becker has argued that although the Qur'an's emphasis on the transitory nature of earthly life differs from pre-Islamic Christianity in form and content, we need only note that there is a difference between the attitude of the Qur'an and the Hadith. about this issue, which will be difficult to explain if we see the Qur'an as a product of a "sectarian environment". We believe that it is much more logical to think that this discrepancy reflects two sets of information that had different origins because the Qur'an is, in our opinion, much older than the Hadith. Another example is a prayer for the deceased, which is mentioned in the Qur'an and hadiths, although in a different way. In contrast to the Qur'an, where intercession is viewed ambivalently (as in the Jewish tradition), the liberal attitudes toward intercession found in hadith literature differ substantially from those found in the Qur'an. Only for Muhammad (in Jewish tradition, for Abraham) and under very specific circumstances—namely, when the intercessor has won God's favor—is it permissible.⁴²

The difference between the Qur'an and hadith is not just subject and concern; we also noticed that their terminology may differ. For example, the words Khalifah and sunnah have different meanings in the Qur'an than they do in hadith literature. On the other hand, there are instances where the Qur'an and Hadith use different words to refer to the same thing. For example, think of a phrase for the ship. The Hadith regularly use the common Arabic word *safina* to refer to ships, whereas the Qur'an often refers to both ships and the sea. While the Qur'an chooses the term *fulk* which is not common. *Safina* appears only four times in the Qur'an compared to *Fulk*'s roughly twelve appearances.⁴³

On the other hand, *fulk* is used only once in the body of hadith and is followed by evidence to suggest that it refers to *safina*, making it clear that the term was not used often in the "sectarian context" that produced the majority of hadiths. Since the Qur'an prefers *fulk* to *safina* in the more widely spoken Arabic, the idea that the Qur'an developed slowly in a "sectarian context" over two centuries or more is absurd. The prominence of the word in the Qur'an indicates that it originated in western Arabia during Muhammad's lifetime or shortly thereafter, as traditional scholars believe. However, it is precisely because the term *fulk* is unknown and never used widely in the Hadith, and the Arabic word *safina* is more commonly used when referring to the meaning of ship.

CONCLUSION

The claims of Wansbrough and other Orientalists can be refuted only by the discovery of genuine documentary evidence in the form of very early manuscripts of the Qur'an. However, it must be

³⁹ Andrew Rippin, "Literary of Al-Qur'an and Sira the Methodology of John Wansbrough," in *Approaches to Religious Studies* (USA: The University of Arizona Press, 1985).

⁴⁰ Fred McGraw Donner, *The Beginnings Of Islamic Historical Writing* (United States of America: The Darwin Press, 1999).

⁴¹ Fred McGraw Donner, *The Beginnings Of Islamic Historical Writing* (United States of America: The Darwin Press, 1999).

⁴² Fred McGraw Donner, "Was Marwan Ibn Al-Hakam the First 'Real' Muslim?," in *Genealogy and Knowledge in Muslim Societies* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2014), 105.

⁴³ Fred McGraw Donner, *The Historian, The Believer, and The Qur'an* (New York: Routledge, 2011).

remembered that Wansbrough in understanding the distinction between the Qur'an and hadith uses a revisionist-skeptical approach by examining Islamic texts and comparing them with current evidence. Thus, the claim that the final date of the Qur'anic text is largely based on circumstantial evidence, and many of them are implausible or even difficult to understand. While Donner provides simplistic proof that has been discussed in some of the above points, it seems to suggest a fairly early date as proof that the Qur'an predates the hadith.

In addition, there are some striking differences between the two sources of Islam. *First*, the Qur'an rarely offers solutions for the political leadership of its people, in contrast to the hadiths which vigorously explore political issues. *Second*, the Qur'an does not mention events that followed previous prophets, in contrast to the hadiths, which are full of anachronistic allusions and interpretations of past prophets. *Third*, when describing religious activities, the Qur'an and hadith use different vocabulary and literary styles. Thus, the contrast presented above refutes the assertion

REFERENCES

- Al-Khatib, Muhammad 'Ajjaj. *Al-Sunnah Qabl Al-Tadwin*. (Bairut: Dar All-Fikr, 1997).
- Amal, Khairul. "Historiografi Jihad: Ekspedisi Awal Kaum Militer Di Madinah." Universitas Islam Negeri Syarif Hidayatullah, 2017.
- Asqalani, Ibnu Hajar Al. *Fath Al-Bari*. Beirut: Dar Kutub Al Islamiyah, n.d.
- Brockopp, Jonathan C. "Interpreting Material Evidence: Religion at The Origins of Islam." *History of Religions* 55, no. 2 (2015): 121–47.
- Cobb, Paul M. *The Lineaments of Islam: Studies in Honor of Fred McGraw Donner*. Leiden-Boston: Brill, 2012.
- Donner, Fred McGraw. *Muhammad Dan Umat Beriman Asal-Usul Islam*. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 2015.
- . *Narratives Of Islamic Origins*. United States of America: The Darwin Press, 1998.
- . *The Beginnings Of Islamic Historical Writing*. United States of America: The Darwin Press, 1999.
- . *The Historian, The Believer, and The Qur'an*. New York: Routledge, 2011.
- . "Was Marwan Ibn Al-Hakam the First 'Real' Muslim?" In *Genealogy and Knowledge in Muslim Societies*, 105. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2014.
- Dzikri, Danang Fachri Adz. "Pemikiran William Montgomery Watt Tentang Sosok Muhammad Dalam Karyanya Muhammad Prophet And Tasteman." *Al-Dzikra: Jurnal Studi Ilmu Al-Qur'an Dan Al-Hadits* 16, no. 1 (2022).
- Gracia, J. E. *A Theory of Textuality: The Logic and Epistemology*. New York: State University of New York, 1995.
- Habib, M. Dani. "Pandangan Ignaz Goldziher Terhadap Asal-Usul Munculnya Hadis Nabi Muhammad SAW." *AKTUALITA Jurnal Penelitian Sosial Dan Keagamaan* 10, no. Desember (2020): 89–98.
- Hakak, S. "Digital Hadith Authentication: Recent Advances, Open Challenges, and Future Directions." *Transactions on Emerging Telecommunications Technologies* 33, no. 6 (2022). <https://doi.org/10.1002/ett.3977>.
- Ibrahim, Sulaiman. "Sejarah Teks Al-Qur'an: Studi Atas Pemikiran John Wansbrough." *Jurnal Farabi* 13, no. 2 (2016): 187–207.
- Jeffery, Arthur. *Material for the History of the Text of the Qur'an*. Leiden: E.J Brill, 1937.
- Majdi, Ahmad Labib. "Diskursus Islam Kesajaraan Non-Muslim (Telaah Pemikiran Fred McGraw Donner)." Universitas Islam Negeri Syarif Hidayatullah, 2021.
- Mustaqim, Abdul. "Model Penelitian Tokoh (Dalam Teori Dan Aplikasi)." *Jurnal Studi Ilmu-Ilmu Al-Quran Dan Hadis* 15, no. 2 (2014): 201–18.
- Putra, D I Ansusa. "RECOGNIZING AN ISLAMIC HERO: The Quran-Hadith's Vision about Muhammad Al-Fatih In Indonesian Comics." *Ulumuna* 26, no. 1 (2022): 119–44. <https://doi.org/10.20414/ujis.v26i1.474>.
- Rahman, Fazlur. *Approach to Islam in Religious Studies*" Dalam Richard C. Martin, *Approaches to*

- Religious Studies*. United States of America: The University of Arizona Press, 1985.
- — —. "The Living Sunnah and Al-Sunnah Wa Al-Jama'ah." In *Hadith and Sunnah: Ideals and Realities*, 150. Kuala Lumpur: Islamic Book Trust, 2006.
- — —. *The Major Themes of the Qur'an, Terj, Anas Mahyudin Dengan Judul, Tema Pokok Al-Qur'an*. Bandung: Pustaka, 1985.
- Rahman, Yusuf. "Pendekatan Tradisionalis Dan Revisionis Dalam Kajian Sejarah Pembentukan Al-Qur'an Dan Tafsir Pada Masa Islam Awal." *Journal of Qur'an and Hadith Studies* 4, no. 1 (2015): 129–45.
- Rippin, Andrew. "Literary of Al-Qur'an and Sira the Methodology of John Wansbrough." In *Approaches to Religious Studies*. USA: The University of Arizona Press, 1985.
- Saad, Mukhlisin. "Narasi Islam Awal Dan Problem Otentisitas Al-Qur'an: Telaah Terhadap Pemikiran Fred M. Donner." Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Ampel Surabaya, 2017.
- Salsabila, Atika. "Dakwah Islam Nabi Muhammad: Analisis Komparatif Historiografi Karya Ibnu Hisyam Dan Donner." Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Ampel Surabaya, 2020.
- Sirry, Mun'im. *Kontroversi Islam Awal: Antara Mazhab Tradisionalis Dan Revisionis*. Jakarta: Mizan, 2015.
- Staff, Emeritus. "Online Directory." THE UNIVERSITY OF CHICAGO, 2022. <https://directory.uchicago.edu/individuals/results?utf8=√&name=Fred+McGraw+Donner&organization=&cnetid=>.
- Tangngareng, Tasmin. "Orisinalitas Hadis Nabi SAW Perspektif Islamolog." *TAHDIS* 11, no. 1 (2020): 37–40.
- Ulfahadi, Rizki, and Reynaldi Adi Surya. "Pandangan Orientalis Terhadap Sejarah Islam Awal." *USHULUNA: JURNAL ILMU USHULUDDIN* 4, no. 2 (2018): 184–201.
- Wansbrough, John. *Quranic Studies: Sources and Methods of Scriptural Interpretation*. Oxford: Oxford Univ Press, 1977.
- Yale, Editor. "Explore Our Campus." Yale University, 2023. <https://www.yale.edu/about-yale>.
- Zain, C.R.C.M. "Integration of Islamic Management Principles and Values According to the Qur'an and Hadith in Fostering Halal Governance in Malaysia." *AlBayan* 20, no. 2 (2022): 157–81. <https://doi.org/10.1163/22321969-12340112>.